

Slide 1: Investing in deliberation: defining and developing decision support interventions for people facing difficult health decisions

Glyn Elwyn, Dominick Frosch, Angelo Volandes, Adrian Edwards, Victor Montori
Cardiff University
Palo Alto Medical Foundation Research Institute
Harvard Medical School
Mayo Clinic College of Medicine

Slide 2: Cartoon of a patient in a doctor's office

Slide 3: Shared Decision Making

Image of two people at a table.

- Problem definition
- Equipoise and uncertainty
- Option representation
- Deliberation
- Determination

Slide 4: Rationale for patient decision support

- 'Effective' vs 'preference-sensitive'
- 'Strong' and 'weak' evidence (GRADE) recommendations
- Patient preference relevant where there are
 - 'weak' recommendations
 - 'strong' recommendations but implementation depends on patient action

Slide 5: Shared Decision Making

- Involving people in decisions to the extent they prefer...
- Option Representation = Accessible Information
- Patient Orientated Decision Support

Slide 6: Definition and terminology

- O'Connor defines 'decision aids' as: *'interventions designed to help people make specific and deliberative choices among options by providing information about the options and outcomes that are relevant to a person's health status'*
- Enhanced definition required: due to developments in stated goals, settings of use and theoretical perspectives.

Source: Eisenberg Center Conference Series 2009, Translating Information Into Action: Improving Quality of Care Through Interactive Media, Effective Health Care Program Web site
(<http://www.effectivehealthcare.ahrq.gov/index.cfm>)

- Terminology: 'decision aids', 'decision support tools, interventions or 'technologies', interactive health care communication applications, interactive health communications systems and, occasionally, 'shared decision making programs' or 'risk communication tools'

Slide 7: Emerging concept of different categories of decision support

- For use in face to face clinical encounters
- For use independently of a clinical encounter
- For use across socially-mediated encounters

Slide 8: Categories of Decision Support

- Category 1: For use in face to face clinical encounters
 - Brief information, prompts, catalysts to conversations
 - Organising information by options and attributes
 - Framework for discussion and preference elicitation
- Note
 - Not the most common type of decision support
 - Require clinician engagement
 - Evidence of significant change in consultation process
 - IPDAS Standards cannot be currently applied

Slide 9: Image of a Menu Options from a Diabetes Medication Choice Decision Aid from an unidentified Web site

Slide 10: Three Categories of Decision Support

- Category 2: For use independently of a clinical encounter
 - Although considered 'adjuncts' many designs assume stand-alone use
 - Often comprehensive and data-rich
 - Often include deliberation tools (value clarification exercises)
 - Sometimes include narrative elements (e.g. video elements)
 - IPDAS Quality Dimensions apply
- Note
 - The common type of decision support
 - Evidence of impact on knowledge, participation, confidence
 - Systematic review available (O'Connor's Cochrane Review)

Slide 11: Image of page from the AMNIODex Web site

Slide 12: Three Categories of Decision Support

Source: Eisenberg Center Conference Series 2009, Translating Information Into Action: Improving Quality of Care Through Interactive Media, Effective Health Care Program Web site (<http://www.effectivehealthcare.ahrq.gov/index.cfm>)

- Category 3: for use across socially-mediated encounters
 - Most have been telephone-based, e.g. decision coaching
 - Other interactive media may well be utilised soon, including social web
 - Possible independent 'decision support', with limited or no connection to evidence synthesis
- Note
 - Evidence available for nurse-coaching
 - Crowd-sourcing & 'wiki' technology being explored by a few groups
 - IPDAS Standards cannot be easily applied
 - Possible exclusion of scientific community by social media

Slide 13: Image of a Cartoon entitled “Random Medical News”

Slide 14: Image of a page from the patientslikeme Web site

Slide 15: Tasks for Decision Support

- O'Connor's definition based on information provision: *'interventions designed to help people make specific and deliberative choices among options by providing information about the options and outcomes that are relevant to a person's health status'*
- Providing information: Option Representation
 - But there are more tasks, different categories ... and so definition requires further consideration.

Slide 16: Tasks for Decision Support

- O'Connor's definition based on information provision: *'interventions designed to help people make specific and deliberative choices among options by providing information about the options and outcomes that are relevant to a person's health status'*
- Providing information: Option Representation
 - But there are more tasks, different categories ... and so definition requires further consideration.
- Feelings about options: Affective Forecasting
- Deliberating about preferences: Preference Construction

Slide 17: Defining Decision Support ...

'Decision support interventions help people think about choices they face ...

Slide 18: Defining Decision Support ...

'Decision support interventions help people think about choices they face: they describe where and why choice exists; they provide information about options, including, where reasonable, the option of taking no action...

Slide 19: Defining Decision Support ...

'Decision support interventions help people think about choices they face: they describe where and why choice exists; they provide information about options, including, where reasonable, the option of taking no action. These interventions aim to help people to deliberate, independently, or in collaboration with others, about options, by considering relevant attributes;

Slide 20: Defining Decision Support ...

'Decision support interventions help people think about choices they face: they describe where and why choice exists; they provide information about options, including, where reasonable, the option of taking no action. These interventions aim to help people to deliberate, independently, or in collaboration with others, about options, by considering relevant attributes; they support people forecast how they might feel about short, intermediate and long-term outcomes which have relevant consequences,

Slide 21: Defining Decision Support ...

'Decision support interventions help people think about choices they face: they describe where and why choice exists; they provide information about options, including, where reasonable, the option of taking no action. These interventions aim to help people to deliberate, independently or in collaboration with others, about options, by considering relevant attributes, to help them forecast how they might feel about short, intermediate and long-term outcomes which have relevant consequences, they support people forecast how they might feel about short, intermediate and long-term outcomes which have relevant consequences, in ways which help support the process of constructing preferences and eventual decision making, appropriate to their individual situation.'

Slide 22: Defining Decision Support ...

'Decision support interventions help people think about choices they face: they describe where and why choice exists; they provide information about options, including, where reasonable, the option of taking no action. These interventions aim to help people to deliberate, independently or in collaboration with others, about options, by considering relevant attributes, they support people forecast how they might feel about short, intermediate and long-term outcomes which have relevant consequences, in ways which help support the process of constructing preferences and eventual decision making, appropriate to their individual situation.'

Slide 23: Defining Decision Support ...

'There are a range of possible type of decision support interventions, depending on the medium used, the proposed setting for use and the degree of control imposed on the structure, content and delivery methods: for example, interventions to support face to face clinical encounters, interventions that provide comprehensive information for independent appraisal and interventions which rely more on interactive or socially-mediated encounters.'

Slide 24: Consequences

- Behaviour support interventions are different ...
- Supporting lifestyle change, medication use and adherence.
- In these situations, motivational tools and the development of new habits (automaticity) are more relevant than decision support.

Slide 25: Consequences

- IPDAS Collaboration: will need to accommodate assessment of decision process not just content
- Deliberation Tools: Affective Forecasting and Preference Construction
- Role of narrative formats
- Role of affective and cognitive simulations
- Role of interactive game technology
- Animation
- Imagineering

Slide 26: Image of check list for reasons for and against amniocentesis from an unidentified Web page

Slide 27: Image of check list for reasons for and against amniocentesis from an unidentified Web page

Slide 28: Consequences

- Development Processes: Evidence, Disclosure of Interests, Development Methods, Health Literacy
- Theory: theories aim to *understand and describe* how humans make decisions: they have not considered how to systematically *improve the process* of decision making
- Role of Emotion: Is it legitimate to accept a 'feeling as knowing' approach, utilizing the impact of narratives and counterfactual scenarios?

Source: Eisenberg Center Conference Series 2009, Translating Information Into Action: Improving Quality of Care Through Interactive Media, Effective Health Care Program Web site (<http://www.effectivehealthcare.ahrq.gov/index.cfm>)

Slide 29: Image of a page from the Advance Care Planning Decisions Web site

Slide 30: Consequences

- These questions call for greater collaboration between clinical, applied and fundamental level researchers
- Recognise that this is an early stage in an emerging science of decision support to help people face difficult decisions

Slide 31: Image the *Shared Decision-Making in Health Care* book cover

Slide 32: Patient oriented decision support hotspots

- Boston-Dartmouth-Mayo Clinic
- Ottawa-Quebec-McMaster
- Hamburg, Maastricht
- Cardiff, Newcastle

Slide 33: Video Decision Aids To Improve Decision Making

- Angelo Volandes
- <http://acpdecisions.com/acpdecisions/demos/>
- Username: YaleMed
- Password: YaleMed

Slide 34: Tasks for Decision Support

- Providing information: Option Representation
- Feelings about options: Affective Forecasting
- Deliberating about preferences: Preference Construction